# BEFORE THE FEDERAL MOTOR CARRIER SAFETY ADMINISTRATION

In the Matter of:

THE DRIVEWAY LADY, LLC,

Respondent.

Docket No. FMCSA-2009-0211<sup>1</sup> (Eastern Service Center)

#### ORDER ON BINDING ARBITRATION

## 1. Background

On June 2, 2009, the Pennsylvania Division Administrator for the Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration (FMCSA) issued a Notice of Claim (NOC) to Respondent, The Driveway Lady, LLC, proposing a civil penalty of \$1,390 for one alleged violation of the Federal Motor Carrier Safety Regulations (FMCSRs). Specifically, the NOC, which stated that it was based on a May 27, 2009 compliance review, charged Respondent with one violation of 49 CFR 383.23(a), for operating a commercial vehicle without a valid commercial driver's license.<sup>2</sup>

Respondent replied to the NOC on June 9, 2009, requesting binding arbitration but not specifically admitting or denying any of the charges, citing only financial hardship for its inability to pay the proposed civil penalty.<sup>3</sup> In accordance with the Rules of Practice, any allegation not specifically denied is considered admitted.<sup>4</sup> On August 6, 2009, Claimant, the Field Administrator for FMCSA's Eastern Service Center, stated he

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The prior case number of this matter was PA-2009-0145-US0045.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Attachment 3 to letter from the Field Administrator's counsel, dated August 6, 2009 (Claimant's Consent).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See Attachment 2 to Claimant's Consent.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See 49 CFR 386.14(d)(1)(i)

did not object to the request. The request is granted.

### 2. Procedures

The arbitration process will be conducted pursuant to FMCSA's published guidance on this subject.<sup>5</sup> The parties will work together to select an arbitrator and establish procedures that will govern the binding arbitration. A representative of FMCSA will contact Respondent to answer any questions it may have about the process, including the choosing of an arbitrator.

## a. Options in Choosing the Arbitrator

The parties may choose an arbitrator from the following sources:

- 1. Civilian Board of Contract Appeals Judges or representatives from other government agencies who have been trained in arbitration;
- 2. Uncompensated neutral parties from local communities; or
- 3. Compensated neutral parties from outside the government, whose costs are to be shared by agreement of the parties.

The selected arbitrator will assist the parties in developing procedures and preparing an Arbitration Agreement.

### b. Arbitration Format

Respondent may have attorney or non-attorney representation, or it may appear *pro se*, that is, it may represent itself in the arbitration proceedings. With the consent of both parties, the arbitrator may conduct hearings in person or by telephone, video conferencing, or computer.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> See Guidance for the Use of Binding Arbitration under the Administrative Dispute Resolution Act of 1996, Docket No. FMCSA-2003-14794, 69 Fed. Reg. 10288, March 4, 2004.

Each party will present evidence supporting the penalty and terms of payment it considers appropriate. The evidence may not contest whether or not the violation occurred because Respondent has conceded the violation as a condition of arbitration. Neither written submissions nor oral argument may contain any reference to the amount of the civil penalty proposed by the party. At a time specified by the arbitrator, each party will present to the arbitrator and to the opposing party a sealed envelope containing the amount of its total proposed civil penalty and a proposed payment plan. Before opening the envelopes, the arbitrator will determine the appropriate civil penalty and payment plan based upon the evidence presented during the proceeding. The arbitrator will provide his or her determinations in writing to the parties. The arbitrator will then open the envelopes and select the civil penalty and payment plan that is closer to the arbitrator's determinations. The arbitrator has the discretion to select one party's proposed total civil penalty and the other party's proposed payment plan.

## c. Maximum and Minimum Penalty Amounts

The parties may not propose an amount higher than the amount assessed in the NOC. There is no minimum statutory penalty for the violation.

## d. Limited Appeals

The arbitration award is binding on the parties. Appeals from arbitration awards are generally limited to fraud or misconduct in the proceedings. *See* Federal Arbitration Act, 9 U.S.C. § 10.

It Is So Ordered.

Rose A. McMurray

Assistant Administrator

Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration

6.29.10

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

This is to certify that on this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_, 2010, the undersigned mailed or delivered, as specified, the designated number of copies of the foregoing document to the persons listed below.

Jean Lazrovitch, President

The Driveway Lady LLC

One Copy
U.S. Mail

57 Violet Drive

Honey Brook, PA 19344 Phone: (484) 364-1918

John C. Bell, Esq. One Copy Trial Attorney U.S. Mail

Office of Chief Counsel (MC-CCE)

Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration

802 Cromwell Park Drive, Suite N

Glen Burnie, MD 21061 Phone: (443) 703-2249

Loretta Bitner, Acting Field Administrator One Copy Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration U.S. Mail

Eastern Service Center

802 Cromwell Park Drive, Suite N

Glen Burnie, MD 21061

Timothy A. Cotter One Copy
Pennsylvania Division Administrator U.S. Mail

Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration 228 Walnut Street, Room 560

Harrisonburg, PA 17101

U.S. Department of Transportation Original

Spinie Miller

Docket Operations, M-30

1200 New Jersey Avenue, S.E.

Room W12-140

Washington, D.C. 20590

Personal Delivery